

REVIEW OF THE B.M.E. IN MUSIC

Classification of Instruction Programs (CIP) Code: 13.1312
Music Teacher Education

OVERVIEW

The B.M.E. in Music program at Illinois State University is housed in the School of Music within the Wonsook Kim College of Fine Arts and includes additional coursework through the College of Education. The degree is chosen by students who primarily wish to pursue a career in K-12 school music education. The School offers a comprehensive array of music degree programs and sequences. There are four sequences within the B.M.E program including:

- Choral-General-Vocal
- Choral-General-Keyboard
- Instrumental-Band
- Instrumental-Orchestra

The last review of the B.M.E. in Music program occurred in 2012-2013.

In this degree students take courses in general education, music (music theory and music history), performance and ensemble studies, professional education, and music education. In addition, early field or clinical experiences are provided in local P-12 public and private schools, Illinois State University laboratory schools, and in other approved settings. After successfully completing the internship, students are eligible for a State of Illinois type 10 K-12 music teachers license. The Illinois State Board of Education (ISBE) grants teacher licensure. Illinois also has reciprocal agreements with the other 49 states, the District of Columbia, and Guam through the National Association of State Directors of Teacher Education and Certification (NASDTEC) agreement of 2005. This agreement facilitates certification throughout the country. However, some localities have additional requirements to become permanently certified beyond those required by the State of Illinois.

Enrollment by Plan of Study, Fall Census Day, 2012-2019

B.M.E. in Music, Illinois State University

First Majors Only

	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018	2019
Choral-General-Vocal	59	47	53	49	52	52	54	54
Choral-General-Keyboard	2	1	0	0	1	3	5	1
Instrumental-Band	111	100	97	85	84	93	97	124
Instrumental-Orchestra	26	20	19	21	23	19	21	16
Total	198	168	169	155	160	167	177	195

Degrees Conferred by Plan of Study, Graduating Fiscal Year 2012-2019

B.M.E. in Music, Illinois State University

First Majors Only

	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018	2019
Choral-General-Vocal	6	11	9		8	9	8	8
Choral-General-Keyboard	0	1	0		0	0	0	1
Instrumental-Band	12	14	16		20	16	13	13

Instrumental-Orchestra	4	5	4		4	3	3	5
Total	22	31	29	28	32	28	24	27

Table notes:

Graduating Fiscal Year consists of summer, fall, and spring terms, in that order. For example, Graduating Fiscal Year 2018 consists of the following terms: summer 2017, fall 2017, and spring 2018. Degrees conferred by FY 2015 by sequence were not available

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY PROGRAM REVIEW SELF-STUDY REPORT

Program goals

The objectives of the B.M.E degree program are intended to assist students to demonstrate:

- the principles of tone production, technique, and musicality with his/her primary instrument or voice
- the principles of ensemble playing in his/her primary ensemble
- knowledge of theoretical principles of music
- knowledge of music of Western and non-Western cultures and how it relates to human history
- fundamental musicianship skills of sight-singing, aural training, and piano
- the principles of conducting, including baton technique and score reading
- the principles of planning instruction and assessments, delivery of instruction, and assessment for K-12 music classes

Students learning outcomes

The BME degree program has a number of assessments all students must pass before they can graduate.

- Music Education majors must audition on their primary instrument for a panel of faculty for admission into the School of Music.
- Music Education majors are required to meet the Level IV piano proficiency before continuing into the professional education courses.
- Music Education majors are required to pass a 200-level applied jury, which allows them to enroll in advanced applied studies.
- Music Education majors must successfully present a minimum of a 30-minute recital on their major instrument.
- Music Education majors must complete all College of Education requirements, including Gateways I, II, and III. These requirements can be found on the Lauby Teacher Education Center website.
- Music Education majors must pass State of Illinois Licensure Tests, including the Test of Academic Proficiency (or equivalent SAT/ACT scores) and the Content Test.
- Music Education majors must successfully complete student teaching, which includes the edTPA portfolio project and an evaluation of their teaching skill.

Program curriculum (2018-2019)

Graduation requirements:

133-141 credit hours including 73-75 credit hours in the major, 23 hours of professional education courses which includes 12 credit hours of student teaching, and 36 hours in General Education. The credit hours in the major include 36 credit hours of music courses, 14 credit hours of applied music courses, 7 credit hours of performance organizations. All students must accumulate a minimum of 100 hours of clinical experience. The capstone experience is a 16-week internship (student teaching) in schools usually within the State of Illinois. Students typically receive two placements (secondary [6-12] and elementary [K-8]) within their major emphasis.

Program delivery

The program is offered on the Normal campus.

The program is delivered primarily through face-to-face or blended face-to-face/online instruction.

The School of Music sponsors short-term cultural immersion experiences through partner institutions in United Kingdom.

School faculty (Fall 2019)

37 tenure track faculty members (19 Professors, 14 Associate Professors, and 4 Assistant Professors)

28 non-tenure track faculty members (15 full-time, 13 part-time, totaling 20.7 FTE)

Undergraduate student to faculty ratio: 7 to 1

Undergraduate student to tenure-line faculty ratio: 10 to 1

Specialized accreditation

All School of Music programs including the B.M.E adhere to National Association of Schools of Music (NASM) goals and standards for quality measurement. The program was last assessed in 2013 and was accredited in good standing. The next accreditation review is scheduled for 2022-2023.

Changes in the academic discipline, field, societal need, and program demand

The number of students completing preparation programs in music education has decreased in recent years. Title II data indicates the following number of completers: 2010-11 ($N = 344$), 2011-12 ($N = 343$), 2012-13 ($N = 302$), 2013-14 ($N = 291$), 2014-15 ($N = 247$), and 2015-16 ($N = 238$). Between 2012 and 2016, the number of candidates eligible for music licensure in Illinois decreased 30.8 percent. Since the last review in 2007, the State of Illinois has listed music as a teacher shortage area from 2006-07 to 2010-11, and recently in 2017-18 and 2018-19. Between 2015-2017, 25 Illinois public school districts reported a total of 44 unfilled positions. Available data indicated total unfilled positions within Illinois for individual years: 2016-17 ($N = 10$), 2017-18 ($N = 17$), 2019-20 ($N = 20$). This shortage is particularly acute in urban and rural areas, suggesting that the program might want to place further emphasis on preparing teachers for these educational settings.

Responses to previous program review recommendations

The 2012-2013 program review resulted in four recommendations.

1. *Develop and implement a plan for recruiting and retaining students from ethnically diverse backgrounds and underrepresented populations.* Recruiting diverse students continues to be a challenge. The School of Music had been holding auditions at Kelly HS in Chicago but found that the number of students attending did not justify the expense of the trip. The CFA sponsors a bus trip each year to CPS schools. The program faculty have recruited some students from Kelly HS, where faculty visit and continue to develop relationships with CPS. In April, Phillip Hash planned to visit the Disney Magnet High School in Chicago to give clinics and develop a contact with the director. Future effort could include similar visits by faculty.
2. *Continue to monitor the curriculum and revise it as needed to align it with changes in the field but doing so in ways that continue to address concerns regarding time to degree and student retention.* Curriculum development is an ongoing process. Recent changes include dropping MUS 262 (Elementary Music Methods) as a prerequisite for MUS 274 (Elem/JH Ensemble Methods). The program faculty are also working to substitute a new course in Special Education (SED 344) for TCH 219, which will better meet the needs of students. The program faculty currently do not teach enough content related to special education. This course will help meet that need. In order to maintain the size of the program, changes are made so as not to increase the number of hours in the program.
3. *Allow more music courses to apply toward general education requirements, reducing the number of hours needed for graduation. Include electives in the program to provide candidates more opportunity to explore personal interests. Address core issues in music education in all sequences and utilizing capstone assessment areas (lesson planning, engagement, assessment, and reflection) as the foundation for all music methods courses.* The program faculty have revised the syllabi for MUS 195 (Intro to Music Ed), MUS 217 (Foundations of Music Teaching and Learning) and MUS 262 (Elementary General Music Methods) to address current issues

and topics. Faculty have also implemented similar lesson planning and reflection frameworks in most music education courses to better prepare students for the edTPA. Further curriculum review is needed to ensure that the faculty are teaching the content tested on the new (Sept. 2018) ISBE Music Content Exam.

4. *Investigate alternative scheduling of early field experiences to better integrate them with music methods courses.* Clinical experiences have been revised along with syllabi for MUS 195, 217, and 262. Students now have a variety of ways they can fulfill the required clinical hours in these courses. In addition, clinical hours are structured in such a way that students get a variety of experiences including direct teaching in area schools, lab band/choir/orchestra, independent observation at school in their hometown area, etc.

Major findings

The music education program remains strong and the largest degree program in the School of Music. It is also the largest music Educator Preparation Program in the state. Enrollment is stable and job placement rates are good. The program should continue to examine curriculum within and between courses to align with ISBE teaching standards, the music content exam, and the edTPA. The program faculty should also consider ways to prepare students for diverse schools and to meet teacher shortage needs in the state. There is currently a high demand for the program among incoming students and to meet the needs of the teaching workforce in Illinois.

Initiatives and plans

- Review course content in light of ISBE content exam and ISBE Standards. (The program will need to meet standards currently met in TCH 219, if not doing so already.)
- Work towards revising a music education course as a designated urban-focused class. MUS 195 and 217 are possible choices.
- Redesign the endorsement sequence to better prepare any education students seeking middle level or high school licensure to teach music.

PROGRAM REVIEW OUTCOME AND RECOMMENDATIONS FROM THE ACADEMIC PLANNING COMMITTEE

Review Outcome: The Academic Planning Committee, as a result of this review process, finds the Bachelor of Music Education (B.M.E.) to be in Good Standing.

The committee thanks the program for a comprehensive and critical self-study report that included stakeholder input over a period of a year. The B.M.E. program at Illinois State provides opportunities for students to have field or clinical experiences as they complete coursework in general education, music, performance and ensemble studies, professional education, and music education. The curricula of the program allow students to select from four areas of specialization: Choral-general-vocal, choral-general-keyboard, instrumental-band, and instrumental-orchestra. The program is the largest of its type in the state of Illinois and is an entitlement program for teacher licensure through the Illinois State Board of Education (ISBE) leading to the Illinois Specialist K-12 Professional Educator License (PEL). The committee commends the program for being accredited by the National Association of Schools of Music (NASM) through 2023 and the National Council for Accreditation of Teacher Education (NCATE) during the review cycle and for pursuing continued accreditation from the Council for the Accreditation of Educator Preparation (CAEP).

The committee commends the program on being one of the largest music education programs in the nation (in 2015-2016 tied for 13th for number of music education program completers) and the largest in the state of Illinois. The committee notes that enrollment in the program dramatically decreased during the first few years of the period under review, mirroring statewide trends in teacher education programs. However, the enrollment numbers have stabilized and have shown modest growth over the final three years of the review cycle. The committee commends the program faculty for their active recruitment efforts and encourages them to analyze which activities are most effective and to continue to pursue additional activities that encourage program growth. We recognize the program faculty's efforts to track program alumni and encourage faculty to consider ways to engage those alumni stakeholders in the program's efforts to increase enrollments.

The committee recognizes the program faculty's commitment to activities that support student success and commends the program for the high proportion of students participating in the University Honors program (typically ranging from 22-25%). The committee also commends the program's support of student engagement opportunities through co-curricular activities (e.g., summer band camp, student membership in professional affiliations, and the Illinois Music Education Conference) and those that allow students and faculty to participate in local and state conferences, festivals, and rehearsal clinics that support Illinois school music programs. The committee commends the program faculty efforts to revise the curriculum to lower the average time-to-degree from five years to four years (i.e., in 2017, 36% graduated in 4 years; in 2018, 75% graduated in 4 years). The committee notes that program graduates are successfully employed in Illinois schools within two years of graduation.

The committee commends the close working relationship the School of Music has with the subject liaison librarian to address the challenges of the School's primary facilities and Milner Library being physically distant while working in a discipline that is very reliant on printed materials. We also recognize that the program faculty have collaborated with the subject liaison librarian to implement a plan for building students' music information fluency skills and for assessing those skills throughout the curriculum.

The committee commends the program faculty on the development and implementation of their plan for the assessment of student learning outcomes. The assessment plan provides for collecting evidence of student performance and evaluating this evidence with rubrics as part of curriculum and program review. The self-study report provides ample evidence that evaluation and assessment findings continue to be used by faculty to design and implement program modifications.

Follow-up Reports.

Plan for diversity, inclusion, and equity. One of the recommendations from the prior review cycle was to develop and implement a plan for recruiting and retaining students from ethnically diverse backgrounds and underrepresented populations. The current self-study report indicates that recruiting diverse students continues to be a challenge, although the program has initiated some activities to address this recommendation (e.g., holding auditions in Chicago and sponsoring a bus trip to the Chicago Public Schools). The committee asks that the program faculty work to develop and implement a plan for diversity, inclusion, and equity that focuses not only on recruitment of students, but also broadens the scope to include recruitment of faculty and staff from diverse backgrounds, curricular revisions that examine disciplinary contributions in addition to those within the current course offerings beyond the current 19th and 20th century Euro-centric offerings, and additional inclusive co-curricular opportunities. Accordingly, the committee asks faculty to renew their conversations surrounding these issues and to summarize the findings of those discussions in a report submitted to the Office of the Provost by May 1, 2021.

Comparator and Aspirational Programs. The committee has included analyses of comparator and aspirational programs in the self-study report guidelines to provide faculty with opportunities to consider the niche their program has among its peers and to gather information for program planning. The committee would like the program to revisit these two sections of the self-study. The comparator analysis primarily detailed aspects of the program at Illinois State, with little reference to its comparators throughout the State of Illinois. Although the faculty did discuss aspirational initiatives (including the reinstatement of an urban-focused course and a plan to revise the endorsement-only sequence), these did not appear to have been informed by an analysis of other programs. The committee asks the faculty to address this through an expanded analysis of aspirational programs that could help develop strategies for addressing the initiatives faculty has identified. Accordingly, the committee asks faculty to revisit their discussions of comparator and aspirational institutions and to summarize the findings of those discussions in a report submitted to the Office of the Provost by May 1, 2021.

Recommendations.

The Academic Planning Committee thanks faculty and staff of the Bachelor of Music Education (B.M.E.) program for the opportunity to provide input regarding music educator preparation at Illinois State University through consideration of the self-study report submitted by faculty. The following committee recommendations to be addressed within the next regularly scheduled review cycle are provided in a spirit of collaboration with Music Education faculty members. In the next program review self-study report, tentatively due October 1, 2027, the committee asks the program to describe actions taken and results achieved for each recommendation.

Continue to monitor enrollment trends. In light of IBHE's concerns related to statewide teacher shortages, the committee encourages faculty to continue to actively evaluate the program's recruitment plans to ensure that Illinois State University is meeting the needs of both the program and the state. The committee also encourages the program to continue to develop and implement a plan for student recruitment, including in the plan strategies for increasing enrollment by students from racial and ethnic groups traditionally underrepresented in the program and discipline.

Complete a review and evaluation of the changes to the curriculum. The committee encourages faculty to complete a comprehensive review of coursework in the program. While the committee commends the program faculty's work that has reduced students' time-to-degree, we also note that the program requires 133-141 credit hours, which is among the highest credit-hour requirements at Illinois State. Additionally, the curriculum includes several zero-credit requirements (e.g., a seminar for pre-student teaching and five semesters of recital attendance). The committee strongly recommends that the program faculty consider these factors during their curricular revisions.

Develop a plan for student success. The committee recommends that the program faculty develop a plan for student success. The plan should be used to increase transparency and communication around "student success" by defining the program's goals for, assessment of, and actions towards supporting students enrolled in the program. The plan may provide overarching structure for other plans (e.g., recruitment, retention, curriculum, and alumni engagement).

Continue to refine a plan for alumni tracking and engagement. The committee encourages the faculty to continue to refine their plan for tracking program alumni and use the system to enhance alumni networking. These activities may become even more important in the years ahead as the program's alumni become more diverse. The program could benefit from increased involvement of its alumni in providing input regarding the program and in mentoring students.

Continue the collaborative work with Milner Library. The committee recommends that the program work with the subject liaison librarian to examine and evaluate the library's journals and monograph collection related to music education to aid in both the selection and deselection process of these sources. We also recommend that the program work with the subject liaison librarian to develop a tiered approach for information fluency learning outcomes for the school, align those outcomes to the curricula, and integrate those outcomes into the student learning outcomes assessment plan for the program.

Continue implementing and refining the student learning outcomes assessment plan. The committee encourages faculty to continue its implementation of the student learning outcomes assessment plan for the program during the next program review cycle, to continue to utilize information gathered through plan implementation to make program revisions as necessary, and to document how that has been done. The committee encourages faculty to periodically evaluate the effectiveness of the plan in assessing student learning to identify any modifications to the plan faculty may deem necessary.